

## BOOK REVIEWS

**Fine, Sarah & Ypi, Lea (2016) *Migration in Political Theory: The Ethics of Movement and Membership*, Oxford: Oxford University Press. 299 pp.**

The ethical considerations of allowing and restricting migration have become part of mainstream conversation in recent years. In particular, the large-scale movement of Syrians as asylum seekers to countries around the world has led to increased discussion on whether people should be allowed to freely cross borders. As pressures to receive forced migrants mount, more countries are simultaneously introducing skilled immigration programmes that allow governments to be highly selective about who they accept as migrants. It is perhaps therefore more important than ever to take a step back and consider what lies at the core of the migration debate. *Migration in Political Theory: The Ethics of Movement and Membership*, edited by Sarah Fine and Lea Ypi, sets out to do just that. The compilation considers whether it is ethical to restrict migration and emigration, discusses what constitutes ethically valid criteria for deciding who can and cannot immigrate, and what the terms of membership are (and should be) in any given state. In doing so, this unique book questions the basic assumptions that often guide migration policy and academic theorization alike.

The book consists of 13 contributions from leading political and legal theory scholars and is organized into three coherent parts. Each part explores a different question around the ethics of migration. Part 1 sets the foundation for the rest of the book by exploring whether freedom of movement should be a fundamental right. While Kieran Oberman's piece defends the right to immigrate freely across international borders, David Miller's piece argues against it. The next two contributions evaluate the ethics of the current asymmetry between immigration and emigration: while it is generally possible to move within states and leave the state one is in, not everybody can freely move to the country of their choice. Christopher Heath Wellman not only has reasons for finding the current asymmetry acceptable but also provocatively argues that perhaps restrictions to internal migration should be made. In her contribution, Anna Stilz similarly takes an unconventional line of thought by arguing that it may be acceptable to restrict emigration when it negatively affects compatriots.

Part 2 of the book considers the relationship between migration, equality, and justice. It explores whether migration challenges or furthers equality both within and between states and evaluates the responsibility compatriots have to each other and to people beyond

their borders. Moreover, it takes a close look at the criteria states use to determine who is and is not a desirable migrant. Arash Abizadeh's contribution argues that compatriots have duties to each other, but he does not believe that this is a sufficient reason for restricting immigration. Sarah Fine, one of the editors of the book, instead focuses on ethnic and racial discrimination in migration policy and encourages readers to historicize current migration policies by way of a postcolonial perspective. Ayelet Shachar similarly addresses the ways by which migrants are selected, noting that even if they do not discriminate based on race/ethnicity, many states discriminate against certain categories of migrants and are highly selective concerning who they admit as immigrants. Lea Ypi, the book's second editor, takes the discussion to temporary foreign worker programmes. She investigates whether they are exploitative and if so, on what moral grounds. She concludes that not only temporary foreign workers but also all workers are susceptible to exploitation due to a global institutional structure that makes workers vulnerable.

The third section of the book examines the relationship between migration and membership by considering who is given obligatory rights to enter and live in a state and to become a citizen of it. Joseph Carens' piece focuses on birthright citizenship, which he regards as something that should be preserved. In doing so, he emphasizes and reinforces the link between civic membership and territorial presence. Sarah Song similarly addresses the link between membership and territorial presence but argues that there should be different obligations/rights for different categories of people (sojourners, residents, and members). The last two chapters of the book focus specifically on refugees. While David Owen has suggestions for how to improve the international response to refugee flows and the international refugee system more broadly, Chandran Kukathas is more critical, questioning the distinction between refugees and migrants altogether and arguing that the international refugee system and its associated institutions have made things challenging for those facing various types of strife.

One of the key issues raised throughout the book is the enduring dominance of nation states in managing all aspects of the migration process. National governments wield considerable power, as they set the terms for movement across their borders, as well as the requirements for nation state membership. It is generally accepted that in a sovereign state system, each individual state has the responsibility to prioritize the interests of its own members. This could be questioned on ethical grounds, however, if one thinks that equality and human rights are more likely to be achieved by open

borders. A major strength of the book is that it explores this debate by looking at it from multiple angles and by touching on a wide range of contemporary issues. Among other things, it considers the ethics around migration programmes that target skilled migrants at the expense of other migration streams and whether it is right for states to admit political refugees, while closing their borders to economically disadvantaged migrants.

While the book contains many excellent contributions and each individual chapter is very well written and argued, one of the things that makes the book interesting is that the contributing authors do not work together to promote a single argument or view; on the contrary, they disagree on several key points. This is most evident in the first section of the book where the chapters directly speak to one another. Those reading the book are introduced to different perspectives on how mobility and membership should be governed and the ethical considerations at play. Ultimately, however, readers are forced to use their own reasoning and come to their own conclusions. The book therefore encourages critical thinking and is effective at stimulating reflection and debate. On the back cover of the book, it is stated that the compilation 'illustrates the importance of drawing on the tools of political theory to clarify, criticize, and challenge the current terms of the migration debate'. After thoroughly reading and analysing the book, I would argue that not only the book's contents but also its overall approach and structure have helped the editors to successfully achieve this.

One issue the book could have elaborated on further is how the relationship between mobility and membership is changing under conditions of globalization and how this is affecting the role of the nation state. Several chapters allude to this. Carens' piece touches on it by raising the question of the relationship between physical presence in a territory and citizenship, and Song's piece talks about how to administer rights when people do not reside permanently in a place. However, none of the chapters explicitly address the new challenges that globalizing forces are posing to traditional conceptions of migration and membership.

Owing to heightened connectivity between places (facilitated by developments in communication and transportation technology), it is increasingly possible that people may move (potentially back and forth) between multiple countries throughout the course of their lives. The implications this has for classic membership rights, such as access to citizenship and other services, are worthy of investigation. I believe political philosophers may have some valuable contributions to make on this front, and I was therefore somewhat disappointed that this was not something pursued in this book. This is a minor criticism, however, given that the book already succeeded at addressing a range of complex issues and ethical debates in less than 300 pages.

While the contents of the book are complex, the organization of the book makes it easy to read. The first section sets the tone and highlights key debates. The rest of the book then builds on the ideas raised in this first section, resulting in an accessible overview. Scholars, students, and policymakers coming from a range of disciplinary backgrounds may find the book to be a useful starting point for broadening their perspective on migration theory. The authors' contributions together comprise a valuable collection that speaks directly to some of the most important philosophical, ethical, and political dimensions of contemporary debates on migration and membership.

Melissa Kelly\*

Postdoctoral Fellow, Borders in Globalization Project, Carleton University, Canada

**Lundström, Catrin (2014) *White Migrations: Gender, Whiteness and Privilege in Transnational Migration*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. 202 pp.**

Catrin Lundström's book *White Migrations: Gender, Whiteness and Privilege in Transnational Migration* explores the intersectional dynamics of being a white Swedish woman migrant in three locations: the Southwest US, Singapore, and Costa del Sol, Spain. Through a multisited, comparative, transnational, ethnographic research project, Lundström follows the lives of first-generation-migrant, heterosexual, Swedish women in pursuit of the answer to these questions: 'how [do] Swedish migrant women adjust to, uphold, or re-create new ethnic and racial identities within [a] contemporary migration frame' and 'how are these boundaries of whiteness reconstructed through transnational migration?' (p. 3).

In eight chapters and 202 pages, Catrin Lundström, who is an associate professor in Sociology and a future research leader in Culture Studies at the Department for Studies of Social Change and Culture at Linköping University, examines what it means to occupy the various privileges of white, often high-income, Swedish women and how these transnational privileges travel and change based on location and context. *White Migrations: Gender, Whiteness and Privilege in Transnational Migration* is a timely and necessary intersectional (Crenshaw 1991) work that opens new conversations in the fields of critical whiteness studies and migration studies. Lundström's writing and analysis flow with clarity and ease, which makes her research and its findings accessible to a vast audience.

Lundström's focus on whiteness and its privileges in a transnational context aims to fill an underexplored void in migration studies. According to her, the category 'migrant' is often associated with non-Western migrants, whereas Western migrants, marked by their privilege and whiteness, 'can inhabit the world as part of a global enterprise, tourists, expatriates, guests, development aid workers, and so on' (p. 2). Therefore, Lundström's examination of migration makes visible a reality that 'whiteness, and to some extent race, are rarely explicit analytical concepts in *Migration Studies*, but rather implicit or assumed' (p. 2). By making whiteness an 'explicit analytical concept', Lundström reveals how privileged migration is built on colonial hierarchies and how whiteness functions as a form of transnational cultural capital for those who embody it (p. 13).

While Lundström focuses on whiteness in a transnational context, her intention is not to 'argue for a general understanding of whiteness in a single global entity' (p. 4). Lundström, who is known, for example, for her prior research on the stages of hegemonic whiteness in Sweden (cf. Hübinette & Lundström 2014), expands on her prior work in order to 'explore Swedish whiteness in particular times and places' (p. 4). Despite the focus on Swedish whiteness, the book is a good point of departure for anyone wishing to embark on critical whiteness studies and it also brings nuanced, feminist analysis to migration studies through its focus on the gendered migration experience of Swedish women. By examining what she calls the 'contradictory location of oppression and opportunity' (p. 17) that Swedish white migrant women occupy, Lundström explores racialized transnational class privileges through the construct of transnational white femininity.

The white femininity Lundström explores is linked to the heterosexual regime and to class status, which can be destabilized when applied to transnational contexts. Lundström's work continues a necessary conversation within feminist academia and activism about the intersectional location of relative privilege, characterized by both a vulnerability to oppression and the potential to recreate it, which

\* E-mail: m.kelly.uu@gmail.com

marks the position of white women. Black and Third World feminists especially have critiqued the posited universality of the oppression of (white) women as a means of obscuring the forms of privilege embodied by belonging to the unquestioned norm of whiteness (cf. Davis 1984; Hooks 1984; Mohanty, Russo & Torres 1991).

The strength of Lundström's study lies in the comparative findings of white femininity in different transnational locations. Accordingly, readers will learn that Swedish white femininity plays out as both 'oppression and opportunity' but in different ways in different sites. Thus, in Chapter 4, the author focuses on the migrant experience in the US, the reader learns about (Swedish) white femininity as a form of cultural capital, which women can and do mobilize in pursuit of class mobility. Here, Lundström clearly and authoritatively describes how white supremacy is reproduced via the use of white privilege as capital that Swedish migrants exchange for specific benefits.

On the US West Coast, Lundström finds that for Swedish white women, white Swedish femininity grants class mobility and security in the form of heterosexual marriage. Many of the women who chose to enter heterosexual marriages with (wealthy) Americans or migrated to the US as expatriate wives were forced to renegotiate their idea of gender egalitarianism, which is rooted in the Swedish dual income earner model, when they became stay-at-home mothers and housewives. Many of these women expressed a preference for this lifestyle, choosing to view it as more luxurious than the dual income earner model they would have otherwise operated under in Sweden (pp. 57-65).

Simultaneously, the women interviewed were conscious that they depended on their marriage for their security; thus, the possibility of divorce was cited as a cause of anxiety. The women experienced what Lundström calls 'gendered vulnerability' – the 'oppression' facet of 'oppression and opportunity'. The 'opportunity' side of the coin was articulated by leveraging economic anxiety through their (dual) citizenship as a form of transnational capital, as many of the participants held on to their Swedish citizenships as a gateway to safety in the form of paid pensions, universal healthcare, etc. (pp. 79-80).

In Chapter 5, Lundström focuses on how gender and racialized relations are negotiated in Singapore, where the Swedish migrant women primarily moved to as expatriate wives, trailing their working husbands. The chapter focuses on how gendered and racialized global migration patterns shape feminized and racialized domestic and care labour. It documents how, in order to maintain a sense of individuality, Swedish migrant women hire other migrant women from Indonesia and the Philippines to work as (live in) maids (p. 102). This hired domestic labour is responsible for cooking, cleaning, and care.

Lundström explains the practice of hiring household maids by Swedish women migrants as an act intended to preserve gender equality for the Swedish migrant within the heterosexual expatriate relationship by externalizing the source of potential gender inequality. The action maintains a standard hierarchy in which the expatriate man engages in the sphere of transnational male-dominated enterprise, while the expatriate woman supports him by attending to domestic responsibilities, but in this case by outsourcing the labour. In this sense, the Swedish women are firmly anchored in a standard colonial continuum where white women are privileged relative to their racialized counterparts, yet subordinate to (their) white men.

The chapter also looks at how whiteness is constructed in Singapore and whether Swedish migrant women benefit from their whiteness in Singapore. Lundström argues that while whiteness/light skin is posited as a preference, it is not 'European' whiteness that the Swedish women embody that is the local beauty ideal (p. 120).

Therefore, the women do benefit from their whiteness because of the status it retains in a global hierarchy and not because it gives them the same level of cultural capital as it was found to give the other Swedish migrant women in the US.

As evidenced by Lundström's work, the 'contradictory location of oppression and opportunity' in transnational contexts brings forth the need for white migrant women to (re)negotiate gender egalitarianism. This gender egalitarianism is analysed as a Swedish value, both by Lundström and her research participants. According to Hübinette and Lundström (2014), gender egalitarianism is also a particular facet of contemporary Swedish *hegemonic whiteness*. It is interesting for the reader to find that in transnational locations, the eagerness to cling to Swedish hegemonic whiteness ends up reproducing gendered vulnerability and racialized hierarchies.

Overall, the book's focus on the migration of white Westerners brings significant insight into migration studies, while its feminist focus on intersectional locations of power and privilege also richly contributes to critical whiteness studies. While the book serves as an in-depth theoretical overview of the complementary fields of critical whiteness studies and migration studies, it also causes privileged readers to critically examine their own experiences and role in reproducing structural oppression in transnational locations. Catrin Lundström has conducted meticulous research from an engaging perspective and provides the reader with a highly engaging journey through the contradictory locations of white Swedish woman migrants.

Nelli Ruotsalainen\*

PhD Candidate SKY Doctoral Program, Department of Sociology, University of Helsinki, Finland

## References

- Crenshaw, K 1991, 'Mapping the margins: intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color', *Stanford Law Review*, vol. 43, no. 6, pp. 1241-1299.
- Davis, AY 1983, *Women, race & class*, Vintage, New York.
- Hooks, B 1984, *Feminist theory from margin to center*, South End, Boston.
- Hübinette, T & Lundström, C 2014, 'Three phases of hegemonic whiteness: understanding racial temporalities in Sweden', *Social Identities*, vol. 20, no. 6, pp. 423-437.
- Mohanty, CT, Russo, A & Torres, L 1991, *Third world women and the politics of feminism*, Indiana UP, Bloomington.

**Nielsen, Jørgen S. & Otterbeck, Jonas (2016) *Muslims in Western Europe*, Fourth edition, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press Ltd. 215 pp.**

This book provides a comprehensive survey of Muslim presence in France, Germany, the UK, the Netherlands, Belgium, Denmark, Sweden, Norway, Finland, Switzerland, Austria, Italy, Spain, and Portugal. Although it emphasizes these countries, its aim is to provide an overall picture of the conditions of Muslim communities in Western Europe. It gives general overviews of the history of the early presence of European Muslims; the causes and significant developments of twentieth-century migration; and the ethnic composition, distribution, and organizational characteristics of the Muslim population. Issues such as worship, education, family, laws, and the training of Imams are examined through a comparative perspective.

This fourth edition of *Muslims in Western Europe* underscores the significant developments in different state's politics in the countries mentioned earlier with the increasing legal recognition

\* E-mail: nelli.ruotsalainen@helsinki.fi

of Muslim organizations, the shifts in the attitudes of politicians, and the impacts of national and international events and crises on the condition of Muslim communities. The book examines these significant developments through country case studies (Chapters 2–7) and thematic chapters dealing with law, transnational and global Muslim organizations, and major political events. The layout of the book remains to a large extent similar to the previous editions except for the ‘bibliographical essay’ – reflecting developments in the literature about Muslim populations in Europe – that has been taken out. All chapters have been updated, including the country-related chapters. This review discusses some themes or core issues running through the country cases rather than treating individual chapters.

The authors, Jørgen Nielsen, historian, and Jonas Otterbeck, sociologist, are prominent specialists of Muslim integration in Europe. They begin by emphasizing the historical presence of Muslim population in Europe, challenging studies that misleadingly talk about the Islamic presence as a contemporary phenomenon. They identify the different phases of Muslim presence in Europe historically and provide insights of each of these periods. The historical account provides a background for examining the shifts in the understanding of Muslim presence in Western Europe. They also underscore the influential role of converts in safeguarding and promoting the interests of Muslim communities in Europe historically (see Chapter 1).

The book sheds light on the politicization of the question of Muslim presence in Western Europe and the growing stigmatization of Muslims. The authors pinpoint some local and international events and crises that have significantly contributed to this development. The local circumstances include the unemployment, underemployment, discrimination, and racism confronting many young Muslims including those from the second generation and the politicization of migration with mounting worries about refugees. These also relate to Islamophobia directed towards specific Muslim groups or generalized towards the entire communities and the ‘conscious’ analysis of Islam and its cultural expression by young Muslims striving to accommodate Islamic values to their present and future conditions in Western Europe. The international events and crises include the ‘Rushdie affair’, the ‘headscarf affair’ of 1989, the aftermath of September 11, the consequences of the Gulf crisis, and the cartoon crisis of the twenty-first century in France and its ramifications in Denmark and other European countries (see Chapters 6, 9, and 10). The tensions following the cartoon crises further accentuated, on the one hand, the sentiment of fear and stigmatization of Muslim communities and, on the other hand, the hate against the Western civilization among some radical groups.

According to the authors, contemporary Muslim organizations in Western Europe have undergone significant transformations (see Chapter 9) that stem from the fact that ‘[n]ew Islamic organizations have taken the stage, and some old ones have lost influence’ (see Otterbeck’s preface, p. VI). There has been major development in politics in Western European states with the increasing legal recognition of Muslim associations, although it should be underlain the existence of different laws gearing to the Muslim organizations across Europe. From the standpoint of Nielsen and Otterbeck, such legal recognition is a significant step towards integrating Muslim associations within the host societies. Moreover, the capacity of Muslim organizations to mobilize and their ability to learn through failures and trials have been substantial to their growing recognition in Western Europe. To this must be added the vital importance of individual initiatives carried out by ‘Muslim activists’ and ‘progressive politicians’ and also the political incorporation of some ‘Muslim

activists’. The authors show that some Muslim associations in Western Europe are emerging as important civil society organizations with awareness of the policy and legal frameworks of the host country. The existence of these organizations is conditioned by various factors including their ability to secure funding, to stand for critical questions concerning the Muslim communities (for instance, the possibility of serving halal food at the local school), and to act as standard bearers of the integration of the Muslim population (see Chapter 9). Furthermore, the growing anti-Muslim sentiment may limit ‘the space in which Muslim organisations can constructively manoeuvre, and some have adopted the only other alternative, namely aggressive self-assertion’ (p. 138).

Another significant contribution of this book is deepening understanding of how the presence of Muslim populations raises several challenges (e.g. political, economic, cultural, religious, demographic) for Muslim communities and the European host societies. On the one hand, it implies for Muslim communities a substantial effort to adapt to the European societies given their minority situation. On the other hand, the question is whether the European societies, in turn, are ready to adapt to the Muslim communities. The authors claim that one of the major concerns of the model of a pluralist society is the risk of social disintegration. They reflect on cultural and religious differences, arguing that these differences can be dealt ‘within an overall political, social and legal consensus’ (p. 192). They conclude that by acknowledging the vital importance of mutual acceptance of ‘positive differences’ (p. 192) and respect in laying the foundations for a socially cohesive consensus based on intercultural and interreligious relations geared towards ‘peaceful coexistence’. According to Nielsen and Otterbeck, the presence of ethnic minorities including Muslim communities and the challenges for a multicultural society require a reconsideration of concepts such as ‘nation, constitution, laicity, secularism, and established church’. Nielsen and Otterbeck argue that the fear is that these concepts ‘are exploited to restrict and delimit the scope for the self-development of Muslim or other minorities rather than used constructively so as to make space’ (p. 193). Interface dialogue can be of utmost importance in strengthening the model of pluralist society and easing the tensions and biases underlying the present conditions of Muslims. For instance, Nielsen and Otterbeck note that ‘the churches were the only major British institution where Muslims found some degree of understanding for their concerns during the affair over Salman Rushdie’s *The Satanic Verses*’ (p. 57).

One of the shortcomings of the book is the lack of in-depth understanding of the question of secularism among Muslim communities. There is a need to explore the issue of secularism within Muslim diasporic communities beyond the binaries – ‘devout’ Muslim versus ‘secular’ Muslim and Muslim minorities (migrants) versus secular European states (host country) – that are misleading (see Gholami 2015). There is also a need to reflect on the reality and fantasy of Muslims’ transnational and cosmopolitan belongings in contemporary European societies. Moreover, the question of the present day condition of Muslim communities with increasing Islamophobia and how these communities engage with the ‘European’ society in response to the feeling of hatred, insecurity, incomprehension, demonization, and other social and economic challenges they are faced with should deserve more investigations.

In conclusion, this book is an excellent introduction to the social, political, cultural, legal, and religious challenges underlying Muslims’ presence in Western European countries. It provides a clear and valuable overview of significant trends, patterns, and challenges of Muslim populations in Western Europe. It is a practical and must-



read book for students and scholars of Islamic studies; sociology of religion, migration, race and ethnic relations; and sociology of contemporary Europe and for policymakers who have an interest in Muslim life in contemporary Europe.

Ibrahima Amadou Dia\*

International Development Consultant

#### Reference

Gholami, R 2015, *Secularism and identity, non-Islamiosity in the Iranian diaspora*, Ashgate Publishing Ltd, Series in Migration and Diaspora, UK.

**Orupabo, Julia (2016) *Kvinnejobber, mannjobbber og innvandrerejobber*, Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk. 170 pp.**

In this monograph, sociologist Julia Orupabo examines how various mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion impact upon students' educational choices and career aspirations in contemporary Norway. Her material consists of 66 qualitative interviews with a total of 36 women and men who belong to minority and majority groups in Norway and who wish to become nurses, bioengineers, and computer technologists, all of which are career choices and education programmes typically gendered as 'female' or 'male' in the gender-segregated labour market. The aims of Orupabo's study are to identify informal claims on professional qualifications – how is the ideal professional subject imagined within each field of study and how are the interviewees to *be* or *become* that subject – and then to analyse how these ideals impact on aspirations and possibilities when entering the labour market. When Orupabo first encountered the interviewees, they had recently started their educational programmes, and in the second encounter, they had entered working life. In order to direct focus towards the way gender and ethnicity are made meaningful within gender-segregated career paths, Orupabo examines the way they negotiate experiences, qualities, and knowledge important for professional qualification within their career field. A starting point is that the interviewees, even after receiving the same formal education, regard their chances in the labour market in very different ways. On the one hand, Orupabo analyses the relationship between cultural stereotypes and ideals of professional qualifications, and on the other hand, she wants to understand how this impacts on educational decisions and professional aspirations.

One of Orupabo's main arguments is that the way individuals make career choices or succeeds in their studies in the labour market is connected to cultural ideas about professional qualifications. She finds that the way professional qualifications are encoded with ideas about gender and ethnicity creates possible and impossible positions for the different individuals to occupy within the three career fields. According to Orupabo, professional qualifications and the internal division of labour within each field are closely related to hierarchically ordered characteristics coded by gender and ethnicity. Orupabo argues that in order to understand the segregated labour market or why minority groups get concentrated in certain sectors, it is necessary to look not only on processes of racism, segregation, and discrimination but also to take into consideration social history and cultural understandings of professional groups and their formation. The hierarchies that characterize the professional fields she studies affect the way the students make choices and cultivate aspirations for the future. Orupabo finds that those who experience inclusion and are identified with the professional ideals regard their future in a positive way, while those excluded by the ideals lower their

aspirations and experience risk when entering the labour market. This process of self-selection is thus characterized by subtle and hidden mechanism of exclusion and inclusion that she analyses through a multilevel intersectional approach. Through her constant dialogue with the empirical quotes, she demonstrates in an elegant manner how individuals have different possibilities of making use of or associating themselves with professional ideals, depending on the categories they are assigned, for example, labels such as woman or immigrant.

Orupabo's study can be placed in relation to studies on gendered divisions and processes of exclusion and inclusion in the labour market. It can also be more specifically related to studies of the professional spheres of her informants: care, computer technology, and bioengineering. Nursing is considered a typical female field of work, and the majority of the recruited students in Norway are women. The number of women studying computer technology is low, and previous research has shown that the professional ideal is masculine *per se* since the skills requested are often conceptualized as those boys learn when playing with computers at an early age. Bioengineering on the other hand is an interesting choice for the comparisons she makes since it is dominated by female students and has not received much scholarly attention. Orupabo argues that the professional ideal of this field that requires qualifications both in health care and technology is gender neutral. This makes ethnicity turn out as an important category in the negotiations of professional qualifications.

Throughout the book, Orupabo intertwines her insightful analysis with quotes from the interviews. The empirical material illustrates many different perspectives on exclusion, inclusion, and how informal professional qualifications create borders between individuals associated with a certain form of gender, ethnicity, or class. To analyse this kind of material with the concept of intersectionality is an excellent choice. Orupabo operationalizes intersectionality through a multilevel analysis drawn upon by sociologists Gabriele Winker and Nina Degele (2011). The empirical chapters are favourably structured according to some of the different levels in Winkler and Degele's intersectional approach. Through these levels, Orupabo succeeds in capturing identifications, symbols, and structures. The first empirical chapter deals with the students' identifications with the chosen education. Here, Orupabo examines the way the students describe their choices of career and descriptions of the typical student in their educational programme. She demonstrates how social constructions are articulated and examines constructions of identity and normality in the students' life worlds. In the following two chapters, she then moves on to discuss cultural stereotypes and aspirations in relation to ideals of professional qualifications within the three fields. In these chapters, the intersectional multilevels are made visible, making her analysis more intriguing. Orupabo argues convincingly that the relation between individual aspirations, careers decisions, and their personal experiences of their own worth and position in a determined career trajectory can change and does so in varying degrees in accordance to their experiences of inclusion and exclusion during the time of their studies and also after entering the labour market after graduation. Her argument gains from the time span through which she has followed the interviewees. The last empirical chapter, where the former students have entered the labour market and some women and particularly students of minority groups have been forced to lower their aspirations and change their dreams, provides an important empirical contribution to how structures manifest and actually affect people's lives. Other studies have shown how individual aspirations and choices are dependent

\* E-mail: [ibdia@hotmail.com](mailto:ibdia@hotmail.com)

on, for example, gender and class. Orupabo's findings point towards the role the cultural and symbolical dimensions plays in the process of social categorization.

Her study shows not only how mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion operate but also how the roads to professional success manifest very differently for those who experience exclusion or are structurally favoured from an initial position. The accomplishment of her study is the way she succeeds in applying the multilevel intersectional analysis that makes visible how many different actions and individual experiences are situated in a highly complex social terrain where different capitals can be activated in different contexts. Orupabo finds that while differently affected by the professional ideals in each field, all interviewees, regardless of being favoured or excluded by them, took part in reproducing and creating the hierarchic cultural ideas about professional qualifications within their field. Her approach to study inclusion and exclusion as a situated process where the interviewees make symbolic dividing lines between different forms of qualifications is very convincing.

This is a well-written, well-structured, and easily read monograph. Orupabo succeeds in putting the structural mechanisms of the gendered and ethnically segregated labour market, where positions are coded according to cultural ideas about, for example, gender, ethnicity, or duration of residence in Norway in a personal context. Her analysis makes explicit how macro levels can affect down to the most intimate form of personal decision-making and dreaming. This reviewer wishes that she had explored the relation between structural segregation, dreams, aspirations, and social mobility further in dialog with research from cultural studies. However, her work is also fascinating as it is. This book can be read by both scholars interested in how intersectional power structures affect individual subjects, career choices, and working life and students at an advanced level. With its grounded empirical material and thorough analysis, it will make an excellent contribution to an advanced level course about intersectional power structures or working life exclusion.

Jenny Ingridsson\*

PhD in Ethnology, Research Assistant in Gender Studies, Mid Sweden University, Sweden

## Reference

Winker, G & Degele, N (2011), 'Intersectionality as multi-level analysis: dealing with social inequality', *European Journal of Women's Studies*, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 51-66.

**Palmer, Wayne (2016) *Indonesia's Overseas Labour Migration Programme, 1969–2010*, Leiden & Boston: Brill. XIV + 202 pp.**

What role does Indonesian state agencies play in the international labour migration? In *Indonesia's Overseas Labour Migration Programme, 1969–2010*, Wayne Palmer explores how Indonesia's labour migration programme sets standards for legal movement of Indonesian citizens into jobs outside the country. The book is based on Wayne's dissertation and eight years' observation of Indonesia's controversial overseas labour migration programme.

Wayne Palmer holds a postgraduate degree at the University of Sydney, Australia, in the Department of Indonesian Studies. He is no newcomer to the field, as he started his academic journey with Indonesia a decade and a half ago through Dr Keith Foulcher. His academic interest concentrated on the exploited realities of Indonesian overseas labour migrants through looking at the relationships between different parts of the bureaucracy and individual bureaucrats' motivation for action. Based on HIS seminal

work as a researcher UNDERTAKEN IN THE Faculty of Arts and Social Science, Palmer's humanistic vision is to ultimately assist to produce recommendations that can be used to develop and implement a fairer system for Indonesia's labour migrants.

Corruption is not a new phenomenon in state's involvement in migration processes; however, the role of state administration in reaping the profits at the expense of labour migrants is inadequately investigated. Palmer's detailed analysis on Indonesia's overseas labour migration programme sheds light on this very topic and at the same time fills in a gap in the literature. Most of the literature focus on the macro-level analysis, for example the exploitation of Indonesian migrant workers in a global context or migration policy analysis intersected with gender perspective (Ford & Lyons 2011; Missbach 2015; Oishi 2005; Silvey 2007). At the same time, a raft of work has been done at the micro level, where they document migrant workers' subjective perspectives (see Lindquist 2010). Palmer's contribution lies in providing for the first time the dimensions of meso-level analysis that focus on the bureaucracy and state administration. Meso-level analysis provides a complementing scrutiny that yields to insightful observations pertaining the development within Indonesian government itself. Bureaucracy in Indonesia has not been treated as significant as in the interstate level, and Palmer's informative analysis complements the gap of internal politics and the dynamics between state agencies, units, and individuals.

Palmer anchors a theoretical framework through introducing the notions of discretion and illegality in Chapter 1. This choice of the theoretical framework is strategic for it facilitates analytical possibility to contextualize the rule of law in the local context: the role of policy rules is by no means mechanical (see, for example, Taylor 1993). Under Asian context, making and implementing policies in the 'decentralized unitary state' is challenging, which paves understanding of how strategic use of the law can be observed in the institutions and among the bureaucrats. The notion of 'discretion' is intriguing and central in exploring the dynamics embedded in the local context – where system does not necessarily function and administration is seldom straightforward.

Chapter 2 underlines a historical development of Indonesia's overseas labour migration programme. Palmer fleshes out the relationship between the state, legality, and the boundaries of legal authority. New Order Regime (1967–1998) is introduced as a key instance to understand Indonesia's contemporary labour migration programme in the context of 'the state is the law'. The New Order Regime 'prioritized the achievement of institutional objectives over the legality of acts that made it possible' (p. 8). For more than 40 years, Indonesia's state-controlled labour migration programme has changed dramatically both legally and institutionally. It began with the New Order government in the 1960s as an integral policy to develop Indonesia's economy. Palmer traces the nuanced development of policy directions in the 1980s and the 1990s. He identifies how the trajectory of ruptures and continuities within the state administration has paved way to both public and private intermediaries maximizing their profits from the process of recruitment. By tracing the history of the programme, Palmer illustrates the outline of how National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Overseas Workers (BNP2TKI) became 'embroiled in the contest for control' (p. 22).

Chapter 3 provides the intrastate conflict around the administration of the overseas labour migration programme. Palmer utilizes the BNP2TKI and Ministry of Manpower to carefully examine the interagency conflict, contested spaces in which BNP2TKI challenged the Ministry of Manpower's administrative role, and the complex hierarchical culture of resource competition. For example,

\* E-mail: jenny.ingridsson@sh.se

BNP2TKI lobbied an open mediation session of the legislature pertaining overseas identity card (p. 88). In contrast to the snapshot at the state's centre as illustrated here, Chapter 4 focuses on what is happening in the peripheries.

Six in-depth case studies are examined in Chapter 4 to scrutinize whether there is a conflict at the substate level due to the rivalry between the Ministry of Manpower and BNP2TKI. In particular, Palmer aims to investigate the dilemma concerning how subnational officials got involved in the overseas labour migration programme in different parts of Indonesia. His research illustrates a diverse practice when meeting this challenge: each locale develops its own way to tackle the dilemma of whether to follow the Ministry of Manpower or BNP2TKI.

Chapter 5 continues to extraterritorial settings, where the role of discretion is examined with scrutiny in three cases: Hong Kong, Kuala Lumpur, and Singapore. Through delineating how these authorities handle cases, Palmer examines the labour attaché and intergovernmental relationships through how the work of these labour attachés is processed. He juxtaposes the regulatory framework in these three cases and measures taken by labour attachés in handling particular problems. In doing so, he examines the discretionary space of the labour attaché within the intergovernmental relationships. In illustrating the role of discretion in these three cases, Palmer assembles data impressively from his detailed interviews, field notes, and informal conversations. The interviews, which are conducted with key actors in the field such as officials and labour attachés, exemplify Palmer's skills in collecting sensitive information and the trust he consolidated with those he spoke with.

The concluding chapter summarizes how discretionary acts are exercised in the administration centre in the peripheral six cities and extraterritorial locations. Palmer concludes that while discretion in the centre is sustaining interagency conflict, it functions differently if we compare it to peripheries and extraterritorial locations. For the former, 'discretion is a resource that allows the state to function when institutional relationships have broken down' (p. 165); for the latter, discretion seems to guarantee implementation, especially when institutions do not have capacity and only limited bureaucratic authority is working.

*Indonesia's Overseas Labour Migration Programme, 1969–2010* is an informative and stimulating read that builds on Palmer's long-term engagement with the topic and devotion to investigate Indonesian state agencies in international labour migration. It provides an in-depth account of how complex it is to implement migration programme through a diverse network of officials, agencies, and tiers of government in a geographically dispersed country like Indonesia. The crucial contribution is that Palmer exposes corruption at the state administration level. This meso-level analysis corroborates corruption on the frontline (micro) and corruption at the political (macro) level. The book can be recommended to anyone interested in the migration research, especially under the context of Asia.

I-An Gao\*

PhD Candidate, Doctoral School in Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Helsinki, Finland

### References

- Ford, M & Lyons, L 2011, 'Travelling the aspal route: grey labour migration through an Indonesian border town', in *The State and Illegality in Indonesia*, eds E Aspinall & G van Klinken, KITLV Press, Leiden, pp. 107-122.
- Lindquist, J 2010, 'Labour recruitment, circuits of capital and gendered mobility: reconceptualizing the Indonesian migration industry', *Pacific Affairs*, vol. 83, no. 1, pp. 115-132.
- Missbach, A 2015, *Troubled Transit: Asylum Seekers Stuck in Indonesia*, ISEAS, Singapore.
- Oishi, N 2005, *Women in Motion: Globalization, State Policies, and Labor Migration in Asia*, Stanford University Press, Stanford.
- Silvey, R 2007, 'Unequal borders: Indonesian transnational migrants at immigration control', *Geopolitics*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 265-279.
- Taylor, JB 1993, 'Discretion versus policy rules in practice', *Carnegie-Rochester Conf Ser Public Policy*, vol. 39, pp. 195-214.

\* E-mail: an.gao@helsinki.fi